



Centre for Peace and
Development Initiatives

Status of Right to Information (RTI) in Pakistan 2020

June - September 2020



September 2020

Centre for Peace and Development Initiatives (CPDI) would welcome reproduction and dissemination of the contents of the report with due acknowledgments.

Centre for Peace and Development Initiatives

Tel: +92 (51) 831 2794-5

Fax: +92 (51) 844 3633

Email: info@cpdi-pakistan.org

URL: www.cpdi-pakistan.org

Disclaimer

Every effort has been made to ensure the accuracy of the contents of this publication. The organisation does not accept any responsibility of any omission as it is not deliberate. Nevertheless, we will appreciate provision of accurate information to improve our work.

Contents

Executive Summary:	1
Introduction:	2
Acknowledgments:	3
Methodology:	4
Section 1: Proactive Disclosure:	4
1) Section 5 of Right of Access to Information Act, 2017	4
2) Section 4 of the Punjab Transparency and Right to Information Act, 2013	5
3) Section 5 of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa RTI Act, 2013	5
4) Section 6 of Sindh Transparency and Right to Information Act, 2016	6
Section 2: Reactive Disclosure	7
SECTION 1: Status of Online Proactive Disclosure of Information	9
Status of Online Proactive Disclosure of Information in Federal Ministries and Departments	9
Status of Online Proactive Disclosure of Information in Provincial Departments of Punjab	10
Status of Online Proactive Disclosure in Provincial Departments of KP	11
Status of Online Proactive Disclosure in Provincial Departments of Sindh	12
SECTION 2: Status of Reactive Disclosure of Information	13
1. Provincial level:	13
Punjab:	14
Khyber Pakhtunkhwah (KP):	14
Sindh	15
Balochistan	15
2. Federal:	16
Annexures	17
Annexure A: Proactive Disclosure in Federal	17
Annexure A1: Reactive Disclosure Federal	18
Annexure B: Proactive Disclosure Punjab	23
Annexure B1: Reactive Disclosure - Punjab	24
Annexure C: Proactive Disclosure KP	30
Annexure C1: Reactive Disclosure KP	31
Annexure D: Proactive Disclosure Sindh	36
Annexure D1: Reactive Disclosure – Sindh	37
Conclusion:	42

Executive Summary:

Report on the status of RTI is conceived and compiled by CPDI. The report on the said subject is an annual feature of CPDI, the first report was launched in year 2019. Categorically, two dimensions of RTI implementation are being assessed in the report (a) current status of online proactive disclosure, (b) reactive disclosure by the government departments under RTI laws. Assessment of both dimensions has been conducted at Federal and four provinces in Pakistan.

The results of the report indicate that the status of online proactive disclosure in Federal, Pakhtunkhwah (KP), Sindh and Punjab are moderate. All the respective right to information laws except Balochistan Freedom of Information Act, 2005 contains a detailed list of information to be proactively disclosed by the government departments. But, the lack of awareness about the significance of transparency and openness in government affairs pulls the government departments away from proactively disclosing information as mentioned in the RTI laws. Websites of sampled government departments were assessed against the proactive disclosure clause of RTI laws. In a nut shell, most of the government departments have abstained from disclosing the budget, expenditure, perks and privileges enjoyed by the government officers, performance based annual reports, internal criteria to perform its functions and particulars of public information officers. At the end, an average percentage of proactive disclosure by each province and federal is presented ahead in the report.

This report also presents a glimpse of status of reactive disclosure by government departments in Federal, KP, Punjab, Sindh and Balochistan. A number of information requests were submitted to several government departments selected through random sampling in each province and center. The results of reactive disclosure by public bodies are purely based upon the reaction/responses of information requests sent under RTI laws. Not at any stage, complaints were lodged in appellate forums during the process. Out of all provinces and centre, the reactive disclosure without the intervention by the information commission was ensured only by the departments of Khyber Pakhtunkhwah. Overall result of reactive disclosure by public bodies is bleak Sindh and Balochistan whereas a mixed-up response was received from the public bodies of KP, Punjab and Federal. (The details and stats are discussed ahead in the report).

Introduction:

A democratic state is based upon the public opinion and citizen participation in government affair. Public accountability, access to information, freedom of expression and transparency in government departments are few of the democratic values of any state. Right to Information is a fundamental human right granted to the citizens of Pakistan under Article 19-A of the Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan.

Article 19-A states:

“Every Citizen shall have the right to have access to information in all matters of public importance subject to regulation and reasonable restrictions imposed by the law”

It is explicitly mentioned in the Article 19-A that right to information is not an absolute right, it means that there are some legitimate hindrances in access to information. Currently, five different right to information laws are enacted in Pakistan i.e. Right of Access to Information Act, 2017 (Federal), Punjab Transparency and Right to Information Act, 2013, KP Right to Information Act, 2013, Sindh Transparency and Right to Information Act, 2016 and Balochistan Freedom of Information Act, 2005. All the mentioned RTI laws are enacted by the legislative bodies to protect citizen's fundamental right to know. Provincial government of Balochistan is working on a progressive Right to Information Bill 2020, which has reportedly been approved by the Cabinet. However, merely passing the laws is not enough, implementation remains an unaddressed question in the rooms of government.

CPDI has compiled this report to grasp the status of right to information in Pakistan. Primarily, to what extent government departments are proactively disclosing information and responding to the information requests with the time period mentioned in the specific RTI law. To conduct this study, government departments were selected as a sample from each province and centre. The websites were examined to gauge the status of online proactive and information requests were sent to evaluate the status of reactive disclosure. However, a keen eye on the political and legislative landscape of RTI was kept to analyse the measures taken by the government departments to implement RTI.

All the websites examined in this report were last accessed on 15 September, 2020.

Acknowledgments:

This study has been conducted by Centre for Peace and Development Initiatives (CPDI). CPDI is an independent, non-partisan and a not-for-profit civil society organization working on issues of peace and development in Pakistan. It is registered UNDER SECTION 42 of the Companies Ordinance, 1984 (XLVII of 1984). CPDI is a first of its kind in Pakistan. It seeks to inform and influence public policies and civil society initiatives through research-based advocacy and capacity building in order to promote citizenship, build peace and achieve inclusive and sustainable development.

CPDI's Program Officer Mr. Ali Javaid conducted the assessment and compiled the report under the Supervision of Project Manager Ms. Moonus Kayinat Zahra. Mr. Mukhtar Ahmed Ali, Executive Director CPDI, gave a final review. Mr. Naveed Ashraf, graphic designer, CPDI is credited with the designing of report.

Methodology:

The status of online proactive disclosure and reactive disclosure is measured by using mixed research methods. Several tools like desk-based research and content analysis were used to reach conclusions and marking the scales.

Section 1: Proactive Disclosure:

The online proactive disclosure (Federal, KP, Punjab, Sindh) of each province and federal was measured against the specific relevant clause/section as mentioned below:

1) Section 5 of Right of Access to Information Act, 2017

- | |
|--|
| a) Description of the public body's organization and functions, duties, powers and any services it provides to the public, including a directory of its officers and employees, indicating their duties and functions and their respective remunerations, perks and privileges; |
| b) Statutes, statutory rules, regulations, bye-laws, orders and notifications, etc. applicable to the public body disclosing the date of their respective commencement or effect; |
| c) Substantive or procedural rules of the general application evolved or adopted by the public body, including any manual or policies by its employees |
| d) Relevant facts and background information relating to important policies and decisions which have been adopted, along with a statement of policies adopted by the public body and the criteria, standards or guidelines upon which discretionary powers are exercised by it; |
| e) The condition upon which members of the public body can acquire any license, permit, consent, approval, grant, allotment or other benefits of whatsoever nature from any public body or upon which transactions, agreements and contracts, including, contracts of employment which can be entered into with the public body, along with particulars about the recipients of any concession, permit, license or authorization granted by the public body; |
| f) A description of its decision-making processes as defined in the Federal government's secretariat instructions, 2004 and any instructions for the time being in force for the public to provide any input into or be consulted about decisions; |
| g) Detailed budget of the public body; including proposed and actual expenditures, original or revised revenue targets, actual revenue, receipts, revision in the approved budget and the supplementary budget; |
| h) methods whereby information in the possession or control of the public body may be obtained and the prescribed fee required along with the name, title and contact details of the designated officials; |
| i) Reports including performance reports, audit reports, evaluation reports, inquiry or investigative reports and other reports that have been finalized |

2) Section 4 of the Punjab Transparency and Right to Information Act, 2013

(a) particulars of the public body, its functions and duties;
(b) powers and functions of its officers and employees;
(c) norms and criteria set by the public body for the discharge of its functions;
(d) acts, ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body in the discharge of its functions;
(e) a statement of categories of information being held by the public body;
(f) a description of its decision-making processes and any opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions;
(g) a directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks and privileges;
(h) budget of the public body including details of all proposed and actual expenditures;
(I) amount of subsidy and details of beneficiaries if the public body provides any subsidy;
(j) particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body
(k) facilities available with the public body for obtaining information held by it;
(l) name, designation and other particulars of the public information officer of the public body; and

3) Section 5 of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa RTI Act, 2013

(a) Acts and subordinate legislation such as rules, regulations, notifications, bye-laws, manuals and orders having the force of law in the Province,
(b) information about the public body, including its organization, functions, duties, powers and any services it provides to the public;
(c) a directory of its officers and employees, including a description of their powers and functions and their respective remunerations, perks and privileges;
(d) norms and criteria set by the public body for the discharge of its functions, including any rules, manuals or policies used by its employees to this end;
(e) a description of its decision-making processes and any opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions;
(f) relevant facts and background information relating to important policies and decisions which are being formulated or have been made and which affect the public;
(g)) a detailed budget of the public body, including proposed and actual expenditures;
(h) details about any subsidy or benefit programs operated by the public body, including details about the amount or benefits provided and the beneficiaries;
(i) particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits, licenses or authorizations granted by the public body;
(j) the categories of information held by the public body;

(k) a description of the manner in which requests for information may be made to the public body, including the name, title and contact details of all designated officers; (PIO)

4) Section 6 of Sindh Transparency and Right to Information Act, 2016

a) Particulars of its organization functions and duties;
b) Powers and functions of its officers and employees;
c) Norms and criteria set by it for the discharge of its daily functions;
d) Rules, regulations, notifications, circulars, instructions and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by it or being used by its employees in the discharge of its functions;
e) Statement of categories of information that are under its control;
f) Description of its decision making processes;
g) Details of all its administrative and developmental decisions;
h) Directory of its officers and employees with their qualifications and respective remuneration, perks and privileges
i) Budget including details of all proposed and actual expenditures;
j) Manner of execution of subsidy programs;
k) Full particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorization granted by it;
l) Facilities available with the public for obtaining information held by it;
m) Complete particulars of its public information officer;
o) Maintenance of record in respect of applications received and actions taken thereto;

Information available on all the sampled websites was crossed checked with the clauses mentioned above and marked according to the percentages given below:

Full	Full to Partial	Partial	Partial to None	None
100%	70-80%	50%	15-25%	0

Section 2: Reactive Disclosure

To conduct this study, a set of government departments were selected through random sampling from Federal, Punjab, KP, Sindh and Balochistan. A set of three (3) information requests were submitted in each department under the applicable RTI law. The set of information requests comprises of simple and complex RTI questions related to public interest with an aim to monitor the different responses by public bodies. Assessment is purely limited to the responses of public bodies without the intervention of Information Commissions/ Appellate forums. The responses/reactions of public bodies against each RTI request/case were gauged in basic two scales with the consideration of issues mentioned below in the table:

Legitimate Response	Illegitimate Response
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Information received• written refusal• transferred• referred• information not held	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• oral refusal• mute refusal• incomplete answer• unable to submit

Sample of the Study:

To check the status of online proactive disclosure of information, a sample of Sixty (60) government departments were selected through the method of random sampling. Fifteen (15) departmental websites from KP, fifteen (15) departmental websites of Punjab, fifteen (15) departmental websites of Sindh, and fifteen (15) departments + Ministries of Federal government of Pakistan were taken as a sample. Websites of Sixty (60) different federal and provincial government departments were examined during the course of study. (Status of online proactive disclosure of government departments in Balochistan was not taken into account, because Freedom of Information Act, 2005 lacks the provision and relevant list of information).

To check the status of reactive disclosure by government departments, a sample of total twenty-five (25) federal and provincial government departments was selected through the method of random sampling. Five (5) departments of KP provincial government, five (5) departments of Provincial Government of Punjab, five (5) departments of provincial government of Sindh, five (5) departments of provincial government of Balochistan, and five (5) departments + Ministries of Federal government of Pakistan were taken as a sample). A total of seventy (75) information requests under Federal and Provincial RTI laws were filed in twenty-five (25) government departments.

Results for this report are compiled over the period of three months and ample time has been given to all the public bodies to respond the information request under RTI laws.

Scope of the Study

The scope of the study is limited to the sampled government departments and departmental websites. We have gauged the status of (a) online proactive and (b) reactive disclosure of information by the government departments. This study does not take the stock of information released by the departments through other means like annual reports, publishing in newspaper, advertisement in media and notice boards etc. There is every possibility that this study assigns minimum points for disclosure of certain information on website but that information might have already been released to public through other means. The reactive disclosure is measured by filing a multitude of information requests in provincial and government departments. The process was confined to the filing of information requests and responses of public bodies only, without the intervention of appellate forums/information commissions.

SECTION 1: Status of Online Proactive Disclosure of Information

Status of Online Proactive Disclosure of Information in Federal Ministries and Departments

To have an overview about the status of online proactive disclosure at Federal level, fifteen (15) Ministries and departments were selected. In comparison to the previous year, the online proactive disclosure has increased from 25% to 38%.

While examining the websites, CPDI has observed that the RTI law is slowly taking roots and the departmental website have started to include RTI in the contents. But, most of the government bodies are not cognizant of their legal responsibilities related to proactive disclosure of information. The common set of information which was not proactively disclosed by most of the ministries are related to budget and expenditures, perks and privileges of officers, decision making processes and investigation or inquiry reports.

A summary is given below. *For further details, see Annexure A.*

Sr. No	Sample Department	Percentage of Information Available on Website as per section 5 of Right of Access to Information Act, 2017
1	Ministry of Commerce	29%
2	Ministry of Communications	6%
3	Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training	51%
4	Ministry of Finance, Revenue and Economic Affairs	60%
5	Ministry of Foreign Affairs	3%
6	Ministry of Human Rights	48%
7	Ministry of National Health Services Regulations and Coordination	11%
8	Ministry of Railways	18%
9	Ministry of Interior	63%
10	Ministry of Law and Justice	78%
11	Ministry of Planning and Development and Special Initiatives	75%
12	Supreme Court of Pakistan	38%
13	Pakistan Agricultural Research Council	49%
14	Ministry of Information and Broadcasting	17%
15	Ministry of Climate Change	23%
	Average	38%

Status of Online Proactive Disclosure of Information in Provincial Departments of Punjab

This report evaluates the selected websites of provincial departments of Punjab against the proactive disclosure clause of the Punjab Transparency and Right to Information Act, 2013. In comparison to the previous year, the proactive disclosure has increased from 38% to 51%.

We noticed a positive trend where some departments have started to proactively disclose their budget estimates and expenditures; although in some cases the figures were not updated. This is a leap forward for fiscal transparency. However, such practices need to be adopted permanently by all departments so that a culture of transparency is created in public departments. On the other hand, some departments have created a separate section of RTI on their websites, but there is hardly any department which has shown complete compliance to section 4 of the said law. One common omission is the disclosure of remuneration, perks and privileges of the public officials which is a mandatory requirement under Section 4(g). A summary of is given below.

A summary of is given below. *For further details please see Annexure B*

Sr. No	Sample Department	Percentage of Information Available on Website as per section 4 of Punjab Transparency and Right to Information Act, 2013
1	Punjab Revenue Authority	18%
2	Excise, Taxation and Narcotics Control	71%
3	Planning and Development Board	59%
4	Higher Education Department	63%
5	School Education Department	55%
6	Zakat and Ushr Department	80%
7	Human Rights and Minorities	52%
8	Women Development Department	32%
9	Agriculture Department	33%
10	Forest, Wildlife and Fisheries	59%
11	Industries, Commerce, Investment and Skills Development Department	52%
12	Information and Culture Department	52%
13	Irrigation Department	59%
14	Food Department	39%
15	Environment Protection Department	40%
	Average	51%

Status of Online Proactive Disclosure in Provincial Departments of KP

This section evaluates the online presence of selected provincial departments of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa province against the proactive disclosure clause of the KP Right to Information Act, 2013. In comparison to the previous year, the proactive disclosure has decreased from 52% to 35%.

It was found that despite of having dedicated RTI Sections on the portal and websites, many departments have not followed the section (5) of KP Right Act 2013 in its true letter and spirit. It is based on the fact that the data provided under the RTI sections is either incomplete or irrelevant. The common omissions are the, list of categories of information held by department, latest budget estimates and expenditure, perks and privileges lived up by employees / officers and decision-making processes are least disclosed on the web. On the other hand, the report shows positive trends where most of the departments have designated Public information officers and contact details are also shared. But there is a lot more required to fully comply with the section 5 of KP RTI Act. Some departments like Agriculture department has also shared a detailed account of number of RTI requests received and processed by the department. Such practice enhances the confidence of a common man on responsiveness of the public body.

The summary is given below. For details please see Annexure C

Sr. No	Sample Department	Percentage of Information Available on Website as per section 5 of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Right to Information Act, 2013
1	Elementary and Secondary Education Department	10%
2	Government of KP	45%
3	Forestry, Environment and Wildlife Department	32%
4	Finance Department	52%
5	Industries and Commerce Department	30%
6	Higher Education Department	27%
7	Industries Department	35%
8	Food Safety & Halal Food Authority	30%
9	Mineral Development Department	22%
10	Agriculture Department	18%
11	Energy and Power Department	27%
12	Revenue Department	25%
13	Communication and Works Department	25%
14	Law, Parliamentary Affairs and Human Rights Department	55%
15	KP Right to Information Commission	92%
	Average	35%

Status of Online Proactive Disclosure in Provincial Departments of Sindh

This report evaluates the online presence of provincial departments of Sindh against the proactive disclosure clause of the Sindh Transparency and Right to Information Act, 2016 (Section 6). In comparison to the previous year, the proactive disclosure has increased from 12% to 17%.

It was found that majority of the provincial departments have independent websites but the available information is in such a small amount that the purpose of establishing a website becomes questionable. This meager situation is due to the lack of awareness about the Sindh Transparency and Right to Information Act, 2016. The said law was enacted back in April 2017 but the implementation is still deferred. The law is neither brought in public domain nor is it well known among government departments. It was also observed that not even a single website had an 'RTI Section'. None of the websites have shared name and particulars of Public Information Officer and perks and privileges of its officers. In most of the cases, budget and expenditures of the departments was also not shared.

The summary is given below. For details, please see Annexure D.

Sr. No	Sample Department	Percentage of Information Available on Website as per section 6 of Sindh Transparency and Right to Information Act, 2013
1	Agriculture, Supply and Prices Department	10%
2	Sindh Board of Revenue	28%
3	Chief Minister Secretariat	4%
4	Planning and Development	18%
5	Zakat and Ushr Department	32%
6	Culture, Tourism, Antiquities and Archives Department	13%
7	Excise, Taxation and Narcotics Control Department	14%
8	Transport and Mass Transit	16%
9	Finance Department Sindh	23%
10	Industries and Commerce	14%
11	Sindh Home Department	5%
12	Irrigation Department	25%
13	Sindh Katchi Abadi Department	17%
14	Minorities Affairs Department	10%
15	Sindh Forest Department	27%
	Average	17%

SECTION 2: Status of Reactive Disclosure of Information

Currently, two types of right to information laws are applicable in Pakistan. The second-generation laws are progressive and more effective than the weak and toothless first generation RTI laws.

Second generation RTI laws provide maximum opportunities to general masses to have access to information via proactive disclosure, overriding effect over other laws, free and easy processing of information requests, maximum scope of the law, short lists of exempted information, independent appellate forums, and penalties over non-disclosure of information. The first generation RTI laws are opposite to the good characteristics mentioned above. Pakistan has a spectrum of both good and bad RTI laws in Pakistan:

- Second Generation law: Right of Access to Information Act, 2017
- Second Generation law: Khyber Pakhtunkhwa RTI Act 2013
- Second Generation law: Sindh Transparency and Right to Information Act, 2016
- Second Generation law: Punjab Transparency and right to information Act, 2013,
- First Generation law: Balochistan Freedom of Information Act, 2005

According to the above mentioned RTI laws, public bodies are duty bound to process the information requests submitted by the applicant/common citizens within a specific time period mentioned in the laws. As contrary to the proactive disclosure, processing of information requests which result in the disclosure of information to the public is called reactive disclosure of information.

To check the status of reactive disclosure of information, CPDI sent a uniform set of information requests to the selected set of provincial and federal departments in Pakistan by using all different RTI laws (mentioned above). We waited for the time of period of three months for the information requests to be fully processed by the government departments. As mentioned earlier in the initial sections of the report, this evaluation is just limited to the responses given by government departments without lodging complaint in the appellate forums.

1. Provincial level:

A set of three (3) information requests comprising of simple and complex RTI questions were sent to each department out of the total five selected departments in each province under the relevant RTI laws. Five departments are selected in each province through random sampling. Different information requests contained the following questions related to public interest:

- i. Please share a copy of RTI annual report of your department for last 2 years. (2018 and 2019).
- ii. Please share certified information about the total amount of funds utilized on the advertisements of all types (public service message, awareness campaign, jobs, tenders etc.) in print and electronic media from May 2019 to May 2020.
- iii. Provide a list of vacant posts of sanctioned staff in your department and dates since when positions have been lying vacant in your department?

- iv. Under Section 9 of Punjab RTI Law– A public body shall publish in electronic form or otherwise an annual report of its activities under this Act during the previous financial year by 31 August each year in such manner as may be prescribed and make the report available for public inspection free of charge and for purchase at a reasonable cost.
- v. Total amount of money paid for the utility bills (Electricity, water, Gas, Phone) from January 2020 to June 2020. Please provide information in the following pattern

Punjab:

In the province of Punjab, five (5) departments were selected through random sampling. three (3) information requests (as discussed above) under Punjab Transparency and Right to Information Act, 2013 were sent to each department. This makes a total of fifteen (15) information requests submitted in the province of Punjab for the purpose of compiling this report. Following departments were selected through random sampling:

1. Excise, Taxation and Narcotics Control
2. Information and Cultural Department
3. Human Rights and Minorities Affairs Department
4. Planning and Development Department
5. Primary and Secondary Healthcare Department

Total No. of information requests sent in the province of Punjab	Total number of Responses received from departments	Information Received by the departments
15 (3 to each department)	2	2

The results and responses could have been better after the intervention of Punjab Information Commission but the evaluation was merely about the reactive disclosure by the government departments. This shows that the government department does not take the information requests serious, until and unless the law enforcement agency i.e Punjab Information Commission intervene after the complaint of applicant.

The table mentioned above presents a summary of total statistics, for detailed results please see Annexure B1

Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP):

In the province of KP, five (5) departments were selected through random sampling. Three (3) information requests (as discussed above) under Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Right to Information Act, 2013 were sent to each department. This makes a total of fifteen (15) information requests submitted in the province of KP, for the purpose of compiling this report. Following departments were selected through random sampling:

1. Chief Minister Secretariat
2. Excise and Taxation Department
3. Finance Department
4. Higher Education Department

5. Information and Public Relations Department

Total No. of information requests sent in the province of Punjab	Total number of Responses received from departments	Information Received by the departments
15 (3 to each department)	04	1

The responses received from the selected departments of KP government are higher than responses received from Punjab. This shows that the government departments in KP are more aware and responsible in handling information requests submitted by the citizens. The results could have been better after the intervention of KP RTI Commission but this report evaluates the reactive disclosure by the departments only.

The above table provides a summary of overall process, *for details please see Annexure C1*

Sindh

In the province of Sindh, five (5) departments were selected through random sampling. Three (3) information requests (as discussed above) under Sindh Transparency and Right to Information Act, 2016 were sent to each department. This makes a total of fifteen (15) information requests submitted in the province of Sindh as well, for the purpose of compiling this report. Following departments were selected through random sampling:

1. Chief Minister Secretariat
2. College Education Department
3. Finance Department
4. Information and Archives Department
5. Irrigation Department

Total No. of information requests sent in the province of Punjab	Total number of Responses received from departments (refusal, refer, transferred etc.)	Information Received by the departments
15 (3 to each department)	00	00

It was of no surprise to CPDI team that none of the information requests out of 15 were responded by the provincial departments of Sindh.

The above table provides a summary of overall process, *for details please see Annexure D1*

Balochistan

In the province of Balochistan, five (5) departments were selected through random sampling. Three (3) information requests (as discussed above) under Balochistan Freedom of Information Act, 2005 were sent to each department. This makes a total of fifteen (15) information requests submitted in the province of Balochistan as well, for the purpose of compiling this report. Following departments were selected through random sampling:

1. Forest and Wildlife Department
2. Law and Parliamentary Affairs Department
3. Science and Information Technology Department
4. Population Welfare Department
5. Environment, Sports and Youth Affairs Department

Total No. of information requests sent in the province of Punjab	Total number of Responses received from departments (refusal, refer, transferred etc.)	Information Received by the departments
15 (3 to each department)	03	00

CPDI team completed the whole process of submitting fifteen information requests to five different provincial departments of Balochistan. It was observed that no response was received from any department within the given timeframe in the law. However, as compared to last year, Balochistan government departments were seen as more concerned over public inquiries. Responses in the form of phone calls were received, but no formal written reply was issued by the concerned departments.

The above table provides a summary of overall process, *for details please see Annexure E*

2. Federal:

At federal level, five (5) ministries and departments were selected through random sampling. Several information requests under Right of Access to Information Act, 2017 were sent to each public body. This makes a total of fifteen (15) information requests submitted at the Federal level, for the purpose of compiling this report. Following departments and Ministries were selected through random sampling:

- 1) Ministry of Federal Education
- 2) Ministry of Information and Broadcasting
- 3) Ministry of National Health Services
- 4) Ministry of Railways
- 5) Ministry of Science and Technology

Total No. of information requests sent in the province of Punjab	Total number of Responses received from departments (refusal, refer, transferred etc.)	Information Received by the departments
15 (3 to each department)	3	2

Right of Access to Information Act, 2017 is a progressive law as compare to the repealed Freedom of Information Ordinance 2002. The Pakistan Information Commission is playing an effective role to ensure the implementation of RAI Act, 2017

The above table provides a summary of overall process, *for details please see Annexure A1*

Ministry of Climate Change		Ministry of Commerce		Ministry of Communications		Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training		Ministry of Finance, Revenue and Economic Affairs		Ministry of Foreign Affairs		Ministry of Human Rights		Ministry of National Health Services Regulations and Coordination		Ministry of Information and Broadcasting		Ministry of Railways		Ministry of Interior		Ministry of Law and Justice		Ministry of Planning and Development and Special Initiatives		Supreme Court of Pakistan		Pakistan Agricultural Research Council	
Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score
partial to none	25	Partial to none	25	partial to none	25	full to partial	80	Full to partial	80	Partial to none	25	Full to partial	75	Partial	50	Full to partial	75	Partial	50	Full to partial	75	Partial	50	Full to partial	80	Full to partial	80	Full to partial	80
Full	100	None	0	None	0	Full	100	Full to partial	75	None	0	partial	50	partial to none	25	None	0	Full	100	Full	100	Full	100	Full	100	Full to partial	75	Full to partial	75
None	0	None	0	None	0	None	0	None	0	None	0	None	0	partial to none	25	None	0	None	0	Pratial to none	15	Full	100	Full	100	None	0	None	0
partial to none	25	Full to Partial	75	None	0	Full	100	Full to partial	75	None	0	None	0	None	0	None	0	None	0	Full to partial	75	Full to partial	75	Full to partial	75	Partial	10	None	0
None	0	None	0	None	0	None	0	partial	50	None	0	None	0	None	0	None	0	None	0	Partial	45	None	0	Partial to none	20	None	0	None	0
None	0	Full to Partial	75	None	0	partial to none	25	partial to none	25	None	0	Full to partial	85	None	0	None	0	Partial	50	Full to partial	80	Full to partial	80	Full to partial	85	Full to partial	85	Full to partial	85
None	0	None	0	None	0	None	0	full	100	None	0	None	0	None	0	None	0	None	0	None	0	None	0	None	0	None	0	None	0
None	0	None	0	None	0	partial to none	25	none	0	None	0	Full to partial	75	None	0	Pratial to none	10	Partial to none	25	Partial to none	25	Full to partial	70	Partial to none	30	Full to partial	80	Full to partial	80
None	0	Partial	50	partial to none	25	full to partial	75	Full to partial	75	None	0	Full to partial	75	partial to none	10	None	0	Partial to none	30	Partial to none	30	Full to partial	75	Partial to none	20	Full to partial	70	Full to partial	70
	22.5		28.75		6.25		50.625		60		3.125		48.125		10.625		16.875		17.5		62.5		77.5		75		37.5		48.75
	38%																												

Annexure A1: Reactive Disclosure Federal

Public Body		Questions	Date Request Submitted	How Request was Filed	Date, if any, of response	Response with in the timeframe mentioned in the law (Y/N)	Fee charged, if any (Yes/ N)	Data Provided Yes/No/Partially provided)	Legitimate (Information received) Partially legitimate(written refusal,transferred,referred,information not held)	Illegitimate (oral refusal, mute refusal, incomplete answer, unable to submit)	Comments
Ministry of Federal Education	RTI 1	1. Please share certified information about the total amount of funds utilized from public exchequer on the advertisements of all types (public service message, awareness campaign, jobs, tenders etc.) in print and electronic media from May 2019 to May 2020.	7/23/2020	By post	1/9/2020	Y	N	Y	legitimate		
	RTI 2	1. Provide a list of sanctioned staff in your Ministry. 2. Please provide a list of vacant posts of sanctioned staff and dates since when positions have been lying vacant in your Ministry?	7/22/2020	By post	25th August	No	No	Partially Provided	Partially legitimate		Only the numbers of total sanctioned strength, in position and vacant positions have received.
	RTI 3	1. What is annual approved budget (FY 2019-20), released budget (FY 2019-20) and total expenditure of your ministry till March 2020? Please give information about development and non-development budget separately								mute refusal	

Public Body		Questions	Date Request Submitted	How Request was Filed	Date, if any, of response	Response with in the timeframe mentioned in the law (Y/N)	Fee charged, if any (Yes/ N)	Data Provided Yes/No/Partially provided)	Legitimate (Information received) Partially legitimate(written refusal,transferred,referre d,information not held)	Illegitimate (oral refusal, mute refusal, incomplete answer, unable to submit)	Comments
Ministry of Information and Broadcasting	RTI 1	1. Please share certified information about the total amount of funds utilized from public exchequer on the advertisements of all types (public service message, awareness campaign, jobs, tenders etc.) in print and electronic media from May 2019 to May 2020.	7/22/2020	By post	No response	No	No	No		mute refusal	
	RTI 2	1. Provide a list of sanctioned staff in your Ministry. 2. Please provide a list of vacant posts of sanctioned staff and dates since when positions have been lying vacant in your Ministry?	7/24/2020	By post	No response	N	N	No		mute refusal	
	RTI 3	1. What is annual approved budget (FY 2019-20), released budget (FY 2019-20) and total expenditure of your ministry till March 2020? Please give information about development and non-development budget separately								mute refusal	

Public Body		Questions	Date Request Submitted	How Request was Filed	Date, if any, of response	Response with in the timeframe mentioned in the law (Y/N)	Fee charged, if any (Yes/ N)	Data Provided Yes/No/Partially provided)	Legitimate (Information received) Partially legitimate(written refusal,transferred,referre d,information not held)	Illegitimate (oral refusal, mute refusal, incomplete answer, unable to submit)	Comments
Ministry of Science and Technology	RTI 1	1. Please share certified information about the total amount of funds utilized from public exchequer on the advertisements of all types (public service message, awareness campaign, jobs, tenders etc.) in print and electronic media from May 2019 to May 2020.	7/22/2020	By post	1/9/2020	Y	No	Yes	legitimate		
	RTI 2	1. Provide a list of sanctioned staff in your Ministry. 2. Please provide a list of vacant posts of sanctioned staff and dates since when positions have been lying vacant in your Ministry?	7/24/2020	By post	No response	N	N	No		mute refusal	
	RTI 3	1. What is annual approved budget (FY 2019-20), released budget (FY 2019-20) and total expenditure of your ministry till March 2020? Please give information about development and non-development budget separately								mute refusal	

Public Body		Questions	Date Request Submitted	How Request was Filed	Date, if any, of response	Response with in the timeframe mentioned in the law (Y/N)	Fee charged, if any (Yes/ N)	Data Provided Yes/No/Partially provided)	Legitimate (Information received) Partially legitimate(written refusal,transferred,referre d,information not held)	Illegitimate (oral refusal, mute refusal, incomplete answer, unable to submit)	Comments
Ministry of National Health Services	RTI 1	1. Please share certified information about the total amount of funds utilized on the advertisements of all types (public service message, awareness campaign, jobs, tenders etc.) in print and electronic media from May 2019 to May 2020.	7/22/2020	By post	No response	No	No	No		mute refusal	
	RTI 2	1. Provide a list of sanctioned staff in your Ministry. 2. Please provide a list of vacant posts of sanctioned staff and dates since when positions have been lying vacant in your Ministry?	7/24/2020	By post	No response	N	N	No		mute refusal	
	RTI 3	1. What is annual approved budget (FY 2019-20), released budget (FY 2019-20) and total expenditure of your ministry till March 2020? Please give information about development and non-development budget separately								mute refusal	

Public Body		Questions	Date Request Submitted	How Request was Filed	Date, if any, of response	Response with in the timeframe mentioned in the law (Y/N)	Fee charged, if any (Yes/ N)	Data Provided Yes/No/Partially provided)	Legitimate (Information received) Partially legitimate(written refusal,transferred,referre d,information not held)	Illegitimate (oral refusal, mute refusal, incomplete answer, unable to submit)	Comments
Ministry of Railways	RTI 1	1. Please share certified information about the total amount of funds utilized on the advertisements of all types (public service message, awareness campaign, jobs, tenders etc.) in print and electronic media from May 2019 to May 2020.	7/22/2020	by post	No response	N	N	No		mute refusal	
	RTI 2	1. Provide a list of sanctioned staff in your Ministry. 2. Please provide a list of vacant posts of sanctioned staff and dates since when positions have been lying vacant in your Ministry?	7/24/2020	by post	No response	N	N	No		mute refusal	
	RTI 3	1. What is annual approved budget (FY 2019-20), released budget (FY 2019-20) and total expenditure of your ministry till March 2020? Please give information about development and non-development budget separately								mute refusal	

OnlineProactive Disclosure																																																
	Punjab Revenue Authority			Excise, Taxation and Narcotics Control			Planning and Development Board				Higher Education Department				School Education Department			Zakat and Ushr Department			Human Rights and Minorities				Women Development Department			Agriculture Department			Forest, Wildlife and Fisheries			Industries, Commerce, Investment and Skills Development			Information and Culture Department			Irrigation Department			Food Department			Environment Protection Department		
Section 4 of Punjab Transparency and Right to Information Act, 2013	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)						
(a) particulars of the public body, its functions and duties;	None	0		Full	100	http://www.excise-punjab.gov.pk/about_us	Full	100		Full	100		Full to partial	90		Full	100		Full	100	https://hrma.punjab.gov.pk/overview https://hrma.punjab.gov.pk/functions	Full	100	https://wdd.punjab.gov.pk/overview https://wdd.punjab.gov.pk/functions	Full	100	http://www.agripunjab.gov.pk/overview https://www.agripunjab.gov.pk/Mission http://www.agripunjab.gov.pk/functions	Full	100	https://fwf.punjab.gov.pk/overview https://fwf.punjab.gov.pk/our_functions https://fwf.punjab.gov.pk/background	Full	100	https://fcd.punjab.gov.pk/overview https://fcd.punjab.gov.pk/what_we_do https://fcd.punjab.gov.pk/functions	Full	100	https://migration.punjab.gov.pk/page/1010 https://migration.punjab.gov.pk/page/1011 https://migration.punjab.gov.pk/page/1013	Full	100	https://food.punjab.gov.pk/overview https://food.punjab.gov.pk/functions	Full	100	https://epd.punjab.gov.pk/history https://epd.punjab.gov.pk/overview https://epd.punjab.gov.pk/what_we_do https://epd.punjab.gov.pk/functions						
(b) powers and functions of its officers and employees;	None	0		Full	100	http://www.excise-punjab.gov.pk/functions	Full	100	https://pnd.punjab.gov.pk/about_us	partial to none	50	https://hed.punjab.gov.pk/ri/objectives_and_functions	Full to partial	75	https://schools.punjab.gov.pk/ourfunctions	Full to partial	75	https://zakat.punjab.gov.pk/overview	partial to none	20	https://hrma.punjab.gov.pk/core_team https://hrma.punjab.gov.pk/our_secretaries	Partial	50	https://wdd.punjab.gov.pk/core_team	None	0		Partial to none	25	https://fwf.punjab.gov.pk/core_team	Partial to none	25	https://fcd.punjab.gov.pk/ourteam	Partial to none	25	https://migration.punjab.gov.pk/ourteam https://migration.punjab.gov.pk/disclosable-information	Partial to none	25	https://food.punjab.gov.pk/core_team	Partial to none	25	https://epd.punjab.gov.pk/our_leaders_bis						
(c) norms and criteria set by the public body for the discharge of its functions;	None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		Full	100	https://schools.punjab.gov.pk/rules_regulations	None	0		None	0		partial to none	35	https://wdd.punjab.gov.pk/system/files/PWDP.pdf	Partial	40	http://www.agripunjab.gov.pk/strategy	None	0		Partial to none	25	https://fcd.punjab.gov.pk/forms	Partial to none	25	https://irrigation.punjab.gov.pk/rotational-program	None	0		Partial to none	25	https://epd.punjab.gov.pk/rules_regulations						
(d) acts, ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body in the discharge of its functions;	Full	100	http://pra.punjab.gov.pk/Download/Index	Full	100	http://www.excise-punjab.gov.pk/rules	Full	100	https://pnd.punjab.gov.pk/e_laws	Full	100	https://hed.punjab.gov.pk/rules_regulations	Full	100	https://schools.punjab.gov.pk/rules_regulations	Full	100	https://zakat.punjab.gov.pk/rulesregulations	Full	100	https://hrma.punjab.gov.pk/legal_framework	Full	100	https://wdd.punjab.gov.pk/governing_laws	Partial to none	20	http://www.agripunjab.gov.pk/strategy	Full	100	https://fwf.punjab.gov.pk/rules_and_regulations	Full	100	https://fcd.punjab.gov.pk/governing_laws	Full	100	https://migration.punjab.gov.pk/legal_framework	Full	100	https://food.punjab.gov.pk/rules_and_regulations	Full	100	https://epd.punjab.gov.pk/rules_regulations						
(e) a statement of categories of information being held by the public body;	None	0		Partial	40	http://www.excise-punjab.gov.pk/downloads	None	0		None	0		Full to partial	75	https://schools.punjab.gov.pk/ri/hathives https://schools.punjab.gov.pk/info_desk	Full to partial	80	https://zakat.punjab.gov.pk/info-desk	None	0		partial to none	25	https://wdd.punjab.gov.pk/helpline	None	0		Full to Partial	75	https://fwf.punjab.gov.pk/flags	Full to Partial	75	https://fcd.punjab.gov.pk/flags	Partial	50	https://migration.punjab.gov.pk/flags	Full to Partial	75	https://food.punjab.gov.pk/facilities https://food.punjab.gov.pk/info_desk	Full to Partial	75	https://epd.punjab.gov.pk/facts_s						
(f) a description of its decision-making processes and any opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions;	None	0		Full to Partial	90	http://www.excise-punjab.gov.pk/organogram http://www.excise-punjab.gov.pk/management	Partial to none	40	https://pnd.punjab.gov.pk/organogram	None	0		partial to none	30	https://schools.punjab.gov.pk/organogram	Full to partial	75	https://zakat.punjab.gov.pk/administrativestructure https://zakat.punjab.gov.pk/organogram	Partial	40	https://hrma.punjab.gov.pk/organogram https://hrma.punjab.gov.pk/feedback	Partial	50	https://wdd.punjab.gov.pk/organogram	None	100	http://www.agripunjab.gov.pk/organogram http://www.agripunjab.gov.pk/feedback	Full to Partial	75	https://fwf.punjab.gov.pk/organogram https://fwf.punjab.gov.pk/feedback-form https://fcd.punjab.gov.pk/organisations	Full to Partial	75	https://migration.punjab.gov.pk/page/1012 https://migration.punjab.gov.pk/page/1014	Full to Partial	75	https://food.punjab.gov.pk/organogram https://food.punjab.gov.pk/feedback	Partial to none	25	https://epd.punjab.gov.pk/organogram https://epd.punjab.gov.pk/contactus									
(g) a directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks and privileges;	None	0		Partial to none	75	http://www.excise-punjab.gov.pk/management	Partial	50	https://hed.punjab.gov.pk/system/files/CONTACT%20UST%20for%20Colleges%20and%20Deputy%20Directors%20of%20Education%20Colleges.pdf	Full to partial	70	https://schools.punjab.gov.pk/ourofficers https://schools.punjab.gov.pk/system/files/list_of_Staff.pdf	Full to partial	75	https://zakat.punjab.gov.pk/contactus	Full to partial	60	https://hrma.punjab.gov.pk/core_team https://hrma.punjab.gov.pk/our_offices https://hrma.punjab.gov.pk/feedback	None	0		Full to Partial	70	http://www.agripunjab.gov.pk/ri/whatdetails https://www.agripunjab.gov.pk/attacheddocuments	Full to Partial	75	https://fwf.punjab.gov.pk/our_offices https://fcd.punjab.gov.pk/our_wings	Full to Partial	70	https://migration.punjab.gov.pk/page/1067	Full to Partial	70	https://food.punjab.gov.pk/contact_us https://food.punjab.gov.pk/our_offices	Full to Partial	70	https://epd.punjab.gov.pk/contactus https://epd.punjab.gov.pk/our_offices												
(h) budget of the public body including details of all proposed and actual expenditures;	None	0		Full to Partial	80	http://www.excise-punjab.gov.pk/budgets	None	0		Full to partial	80	https://hed.punjab.gov.pk/our_budget	Full	100	https://schools.punjab.gov.pk/budget	Full	100	https://zakat.punjab.gov.pk/budget	Partial	45	https://hrma.punjab.gov.pk/budget	None	0		Full to Partial	70	http://www.agripunjab.gov.pk/disclosable-documents?type=budget_of_the_department	None	0		None	0		Full to Partial	75	https://migration.punjab.gov.pk/ri-budget https://migration.punjab.gov.pk/disclosable-information	Partial	50	https://food.punjab.gov.pk/budget	None	0							
(i) amount of subsidy and details of beneficiaries if the public body provides any subsidy;	N/A			N/A	0		N/A		Full	100	https://hed.punjab.gov.pk/our_budget https://hed.punjab.gov.pk/system/files/Last%20Five%20Year%20Non%20developmentAlllocation%20of%20Public%20Sector%20Universities.pdf	Full	100	https://schools.punjab.gov.pk/new_article25a	Partial to none	25	https://zakat.punjab.gov.pk/ourbeneficiaries	Full	100	https://hrma.punjab.gov.pk/development_schemes	N/A			None	0		N/A			N/A			None	0		N/A			None	0		N/A						
(j) particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body	None			None			Full to Partial	60	https://pnd.punjab.gov.pk/collabrating_partners	Partial	50	https://hed.punjab.gov.pk/attached-departments https://hed.punjab.gov.pk/system/files/Last%20Five%20Year%20Non%20developmentAlllocation%20of%20Public%20Sector%20Universities.pdf	None	0	https://zakat.punjab.gov.pk/beneficiaries_info	Full to partial	70	https://hrma.punjab.gov.pk/development_schemes	None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0	
(k) facilities available with the public body for obtaining information held by it;	Full	100	http://pra.punjab.gov.pk/Home/index#	Full	100	http://www.excise-punjab.gov.pk/ri	Full	100	https://pnd.punjab.gov.pk/ri	Full	100	https://hed.punjab.gov.pk/ri	Full to partial	75	https://zakat.punjab.gov.pk/system/files/PUBLIC%20INFORMATION%20OFFICER.pdf https://zakat.punjab.gov.pk/info-desk	Full	100	https://hrma.punjab.gov.pk/contact_us https://hrma.punjab.gov.pk/information_desk	partial to none	25	https://wdd.punjab.gov.pk/helpline	Partial	50	http://www.agripunjab.gov.pk/downloadforms	Full	100	https://fwf.punjab.gov.pk/pios https://fwf.punjab.gov.pk/one_window	Full	100	https://fcd.punjab.gov.pk/contact_us https://fcd.punjab.gov.pk/forms	Full	100	https://migration.punjab.gov.pk/info_desk https://migration.punjab.gov.pk/flags	Partial	50	https://food.punjab.gov.pk/contact	Partial to none	25	https://epd.punjab.gov.pk/info_desk									
(l) name, designation and other particulars of the public information officer of the public body; and	0	0		Full	100	http://www.excise-punjab.gov.pk/ri	Full	100	https://pnd.punjab.gov.pk/system/files/List%20of%20PDS_0.pdf#overlaid-context=ri	Full	100	https://hed.punjab.gov.pk/ri/contactdetails	None	0	https://zakat.punjab.gov.pk/system/files/PUBLIC%20INFORMATION%20OFFICER.pdf	Partial	50	https://hrma.punjab.gov.pk/contact_us	None	0		None	0		Full	100	https://fwf.punjab.gov.pk/pios	Full	100	https://fcd.punjab.gov.pk/contact_us	Full	100	https://migration.punjab.gov.pk/core_team	None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0				
Average Percentage		18.18181818			71.36363636			59.09090909			62.5			80.41666667			58.63636364			52.08333333			31.81818182			33.33333333			58.63636364			61.36363636			52%			59.09090909			40.45454545							
Overall Status of Online Proactive Disclosure in Punjab	48.1735556																																															

Annexure B1: Reactive Disclosure - Punjab

Public Body		Questions	Date Request Submitted	How Request was Filed	Date, if any, of response	Response with in the timeframe mentioned in the law (Y/N)	Fee charged, if any (Yes/N)	Data Provided Yes/No/Partially provided)	Legitimate (Information received) Partially legitimate(written refusal,transferred,referr ed,information not held)	Illegitimate (oral refusal, mute refusal, incomplete answer,unable to submit)	Comments
Excise and Taxation Department	RTI 1	1. Please share certified information about the total amount of funds utilized on the advertisements of all types (public service message, awareness campaign, jobs, tenders etc.) in print and electronic media from May 2019 to May 2020.	7/22/2020	By post	No response	N	N	No		illegitimate(mute refusal)	
	RTI 2	1. Under Section 9 of Punjab RTI Law – A public body shall publish in electronic form or otherwise an annual report of its activities under this Act during the previous financial year by 31 August each year in such manner as may be prescribed and make the report available for public inspection free of charge and for purchase at a reasonable cost. 2. Please share a copy of RTI annual report of your department for last 2 years. (2018 and 2019).	7/24/2020	By post	No response	N	N	No		Illegitimate/Unable to Submit	

Public Body		Questions	Date Request Submitted	How Request was Filed	Date, if any, of response	Response with in the timeframe mentioned in the law (Y/N)	Fee charged, if any (Yes/ N)	Data Provided Yes/No/Partially provided)	Legitimate (Information received) Partially legitimate(written refusal,transferred,referr ed,information not held)	Illegitimate (oral refusal, mute refusal, incomplete answer,unable to submit)	Comments
	RTI 3	1. Provide a list of vacant posts of sanctioned staff in your department and dates since when positions have been lying vacant in your department?	7/27/2020	By post	No response	N	N	No		illegitimate(mute refusal)	
Human Rights and Minority Affairs Department Punjab	RTI 1	1. Please share certified information about the total amount of funds utilized on the advertisements of all types (public service message, awareness campaign, jobs, tenders etc.) in print and electronic media from May 2019 to May 2020.	7/22/2020	By post	No response	N	N	No		illegitimate(mute refusal)	

Public Body		Questions	Date Request Submitted	How Request was Filed	Date, if any, of response	Response with in the timeframe mentioned in the law (Y/N)	Fee charged, if any (Yes/N)	Data Provided Yes/No/Partially provided)	Legitimate (Information received) Partially legitimate(written refusal,transferred,referr ed,information not held)	Illegitimate (oral refusal, mute refusal, incomplete answer,unable to submit)	Comments
	RTI 2	1. Under Section 9 of Punjab RTI Law- A public body shall publish in electronic form or otherwise an annual report of its activities under this Act during the previous financial year by 31 August each year in such manner as may be prescribed and make the report available for public inspection free of charge and for purchase at a reasonable cost. 2. Please share a copy of RTI annual report of your department for last 2 years. (2018 and 2019).	7/24/2020	By post	No response	N	N	No		illegitimate(mute refusal)	
	RTI 3	1. Provide a list of vacant posts of sanctioned staff in your department and dates since when positions have been lying vacant in your department?	7/27/2020	By post	No response	N	N	No		illegitimate(mute refusal)	

Public Body		Questions	Date Request Submitted	How Request was Filed	Date, if any, of response	Response with in the timeframe mentioned in the law (Y/N)	Fee charged, if any (Yes/ N)	Data Provided Yes/No/Partially provided)	Legitimate (Information received) Partially legitimate(written refusal,transferred,referr ed,information not held)	Illegitimate (oral refusal, mute refusal, incomplete answer,unable to submit)	Comments
Information and Culture Department Punjab	RTI 1	1. Please share certified information about the total amount of funds utilized on the advertisements of all types (public service message, awareness campaign, jobs, tenders etc.) in print and electronic media from May 2019 to May 2020.	7/22/2020	By post	No response	N	N	No		illegitimate(mute refusal)	
	RTI 2	1. Under Section 9 of Punjab RTI Law – A public body shall publish in electronic form or otherwise an annual report of its activities under this Act during the previous financial year by 31 August each year in such manner as may be prescribed and make the report available for public inspection free of charge and for purchase at a reasonable cost. 2. Please share a copy of RTI annual report of your department for last 2 years. (2018 and 2019).	7/24/2020	By post	No response	N	N	No		illegitimate(mute refusal)	
	RTI 3	1. Provide a list of vacant posts of sanctioned staff in your department and dates since when positions have been lying vacant in your department?	7/27/2020	By post	No response	N	N	No		illegitimate(mute refusal)	

Public Body		Questions	Date Request Submitted	How Request was Filed	Date, if any, of response	Response with in the timeframe mentioned in the law (Y/N)	Fee charged, if any (Yes/ N)	Data Provided Yes/No/Partially provided)	Legitimate (Information received) Partially legitimate(written refusal,transferred,referr ed,information not held)	Illegitimate (oral refusal, mute refusal, incomplete answer,unable to submit)	Comments
Planning and Developing Department Punjab	RTI 1	1. Please share certified information about the total amount of funds utilized on the advertisements of all types (public service message, awareness campaign, jobs, tenders etc.) in print and electronic media from May 2019 to May 2020.	7/22/2020	By post	No response	N	N	No		illegitimate(mute refusal)	
	RTI 2	1. Under Section 9 of Punjab RTI Law – A public body shall publish in electronic form or otherwise an annual report of its activities under this Act during the previous financial year by 31 August each year in such manner as may be prescribed and make the report available for public inspection free of charge and for purchase at a reasonable cost. 2. Please share a copy of RTI annual report of your department for last 2 years. (2018 and 2019).	7/24/2020	By post	No response	N	N	No		illegitimate(mute refusal)	
	RTI 3	1. Provide a list of vacant posts of sanctioned staff in your department and dates since when positions have been lying vacant in your department?	7/27/2020	By post	9/17/2020	N	N	No	Legitimate (information received)	illegitimate(mute refusal)	

Public Body		Questions	Date Request Submitted	How Request was Filed	Date, if any, of response	Response with in the timeframe mentioned in the law (Y/N)	Fee charged, if any (Yes/N)	Data Provided Yes/No/Partially provided)	Legitimate (Information received) Partially legitimate(written refusal,transferred,referr ed,information not held)	Illegitimate (oral refusal, mute refusal, incomplete answer,unable to submit)	Comments
Primary and Secondary Healthcare Department Punjab	RTI 1	1. Please share certified information about the total amount of funds utilized on the advertisements of all types (public service message, awareness campaign, jobs, tenders etc.) in print and electronic media from May 2019 to May 2020.	7/22/2020	By post	10/9/2020	Y	N	Yes	Legitimate (information received)	illegitimate(mute refusal)	
	RTI 2	1. Under Section 9 of Punjab RTI Law – A public body shall publish in electronic form or otherwise an annual report of its activities under this Act during the previous financial year by 31 August each year in such manner as may be prescribed and make the report available for public inspection free of charge and for purchase at a reasonable cost. 2. Please share a copy of RTI annual report of your department for last 2 years. (2018 and 2019).	7/24/2020	By post	No response	N	N	No		illegitimate(mute refusal)	
	RTI 3	1. Provide a list of vacant posts of sanctioned staff in your department and dates since when positions have been lying vacant in your department?	7/27/2020	By post	No response	N	N	No		illegitimate(mute refusal)	

Online Proactive Disclosure																																													
	Elementary and Secondary Education Department			Government of KP			Forestry, Environment and Wildlife Department			Finance Department			Industries and Commerce Department			Higher Education Department			Industries Department			Food Safety & Halal Food Authority			Mineral Development Department			Agriculture Department			Energy and Power Department			Revenue Department			Communication and Works Department,			Law, Parliamentary Affairs and Human Rights Department			KP Right to Information Commission		
Section 5 of KP RTI Laws	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)						
(a) Acts and subordinate legislation such as rules, regulations, notifications, bye-laws, manuals and orders having the force of law in the Province,	Partial to none	25	https://kpese.gov.pk/category/notifications/	Full	100	http://ko.gov.pk/page_type/rules http://kp.gov.pk/page/rule_of_business	Full	100	http://few.kp.gov.pk/	Full	100	https://www.finance.kp.gov.pk/articles/rules-and-regulations/funds-acts https://www.finance.kp.gov.pk/articles/rules-and-regulations/general-rules https://www.finance.kp.gov.pk/articles/rules-and-regulations/financial-rules	Full	100	http://industries.kp.gov.pk/	Full	100	http://hed.gkp.pk/?page_id=1269	Full	100	http://healthkp.gov.pk/downloads/view/6 http://healthkp.gov.pk/downloads/view/8 http://healthkp.gov.pk/downloads/view/12 http://healthkp.gov.pk/downloads/view/3	Full	100	https://kpfsa.gov.pk/act_reg.php	Full	100	http://kominerals.gov.pk/template-main/downloads	Full to Partial	75	Full	100	http://www.kokep.gov.pk/download44.html http://www.kokep.gov.pk/policies.html	Full	100	https://revenue.kp.gov.pk/acts/ https://revenue.kp.gov.pk/policies/ https://revenue.kp.gov.pk/notifications/ https://revenue.kp.gov.pk/rules/	Partial to none	25	Full	100	http://law.kp.gov.pk/page/rti_information	Full	100	http://www.kptri.gov.pk/documents/1_9935.pdf		
(b) information about the public body, including its organization, functions, duties, powers and any services it provides to the public;	Partial	50	https://kpese.gov.pk/	Full to partial	75	http://few.kp.gov.pk/page/introduction	Full to partial	75	http://few.kp.gov.pk/page/government_3	Full to partial	100	https://www.finance.kp.gov.pk/articles/about/finance-department/overview	Full	100	http://industries.kp.gov.pk/page/introduction http://industries.kp.gov.pk/page/functions	Full to Partial	80	http://hed.gkp.pk/?page_id=175	Partial	50	http://healthkp.gov.pk/about	Full to partial	75	https://kpfsa.gov.pk/aboutus.php	Partial	50	http://kominerals.gov.pk/template-main/get_pages/11	Partial to none	25	Full to partial	75	http://www.kokep.gov.pk/objectives.html http://www.kokep.gov.pk/function.html http://www.kokep.gov.pk/mission.html	Full to partial	75	https://revenue.kp.gov.pk/about/ http://revenue.kp.gov.pk/	Full to partial	75	https://www.cwd.gkp.pk/aboutandw.php	Full	100	http://law.kp.gov.pk/page/rti_information	Full	100	http://www.kptri.gov.pk/page.php?PageId=97&MenuId=12 http://www.kptri.gov.pk/page.php?PageId=45&MenuId=5	
(c) a directory of its officers and employees, including a description of their powers and functions and their respective remunerations, perks and privileges;	None	0		Partial	50	http://kp.gov.pk/page_type/contacts	Partial	50	http://few.kp.gov.pk/page/departments_contacts	Partial	50	https://www.finance.kp.gov.pk/articles/about/contact/phone-directory	Partial	50	http://industries.kp.gov.pk/	Partial	50	http://hed.gkp.pk/?page_id=291	Partial	50	http://healthkp.gov.pk/contact	Partial to none	15	https://kpfsa.gov.pk/team.php	Partial to none	25	http://kominerals.gov.pk/template-main/contact_us	None	0	Partial	50	http://www.kokep.gov.pk/cour%20team.html http://www.kokep.gov.pk/contact.html	Partial	50	https://revenue.kp.gov.pk/contact/	Full to partial	75	https://www.cwd.gkp.pk/contact-sec.php https://www.cwd.gkp.pk/sen_list2.php	Full to partial	75	http://law.kp.gov.pk/page/directory_of_officers	Full	100	http://www.kptri.gov.pk/page.php?PageId=97&MenuId=12	
(d) norms and criteria set by the public body for the discharge of its functions, including any rules, manuals or policies used by its employees to this end;	None	0		Full	100	http://ko.gov.pk/page/rule_of_business	None	0		Full to partial	75	https://www.finance.kp.gov.pk/articles/rti-proactive-disclosures	None	0		Partial	50	http://hed.gkp.pk/?page_id=1269	Full to partial	80	http://healthkp.gov.pk/downloads/view/3 http://healthkp.gov.pk/downloads/view/7	Full to partial	70	https://kpfsa.gov.pk/sop.php	None	0	Partial to none	25	http://agriculture.kp.gov.pk/page/downloads1	Partial	50	http://www.kokep.gov.pk/download4.html	None	0	Partial to none	20	https://www.cwd.gkp.pk/downloads.php	None	0	Full	100	http://www.kptri.gov.pk/page.php?PageId=97&MenuId=12			
(e) a description of its decision making processes and any opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions;	None	0		None	0		Partial	50	http://few.kp.gov.pk/page/organogram	Full to partial	75	https://www.finance.kp.gov.pk/articles/rti-proactive-disclosures https://www.finance.kp.gov.pk/articles/about/finance-department/organogram	None	0		None	0		Full to partial	80	http://healthkp.gov.pk/downloads/view/3 http://healthkp.gov.pk/downloads/view/7	Partial	50	https://kpfsa.gov.pk/sop.php	None	0	Partial to none	25	http://www.kokep.gov.pk/organogram.html	Partial to none	25	http://www.kokep.gov.pk/organogram.html	Partial to none	20	https://www.cwd.gkp.pk/organization%20chart%20C&W%20Revised.htm https://www.cwd.gkp.pk/sen_list2.php	None	0	Full to partial	75	http://www.kptri.gov.pk/page.php?PageId=97&MenuId=12					
(f) relevant facts and background information relating to important policies and decisions which are being formulated or have been made and which affect the public;	None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		Partial to none	25	http://healthkp.gov.pk/contact	None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0	None	0		None	0		None	0		Partial	50	http://kp.gov.pk/uploads/2018/05/KP_Human_Rights_Policy.pdf	Partial	50	http://www.kptri.gov.pk/page.php?PageId=97&MenuId=12	
(g)) a detailed budget of the public body, including proposed and actual expenditures;	None	0		Full	100	http://kp.gov.pk/uploads/2017/08/citizen-budget-urdu_2017-182.pdf	None	0		Full	100	https://www.finance.kp.gov.pk/articles/budget/budget-estimates/budget-estimates-2019-20	None	0		Partial to none	20	http://hed.gkp.pk/?page_id=974	None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		Full	100	http://kp.gov.pk/uploads/2019/08/Detail_Budget.pdf	Full	100	http://www.kptri.gov.pk/page.php?PageId=90&MenuId=12
(h) details about any subsidy or benefit programmes operated by the public body, including details about the amount or benefits provided and the beneficiaries;	None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		N/A		
(i) particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits, licenses or authorizations granted by the public body;	None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		N/A		
(j) the categories of information held by the public body;	None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		Full	100	http://law.kp.gov.pk/page/rti_information	Full	100	http://www.kptri.gov.pk/page.php?PageId=97&MenuId=12
(k) a description of the manner in which requests for information may be made to the public body, including the name, title and contact details of all designated officers; (PIO)	Partial to none	30	https://kpese.gov.pk/contact/	Full to partial	75	http://ko.gov.pk/page/rti	Full to partial	75	http://few.kp.gov.pk/page/pio	Full to partial	75	https://www.finance.kp.gov.pk/articles/about/contact/phone-directory	Full to Partial	75	http://industries.kp.gov.pk/page/pio	None	0	http://healthkp.gov.pk/files/Public_Information_Officers_Contacts.pdf	Full to Partial	75	http://healthkp.gov.pk/files/Public_Information_Officers_Contacts.pdf	Partial to none	25	https://kpfsa.gov.pk/complaint.php	Partial	40	http://kominerals.gov.pk/template-main/downloads http://kominerals.gov.pk/template-main/contact_us	Partial	50	http://agriculture.kp.gov.pk/page/pio	None	0		None	0		Full to partial	75	http://law.kp.gov.pk/page/pio	Full	100	http://www.kptri.gov.pk/page.php?PageId=43&MenuId=5			
Average Percentage		9.545454545			45.45454545			31.8181818			52.27272727			29.54545455		27.27272727			34.54545455		30.45454545				21.8181818		18.1818182		27.27272727		24.5			24.54545455			54.54545455			91.66666667					
Overall Average of Proactive Disclosure of Information		35%																																											

Annexure C1: Reactive Disclosure KP

Public Body		Question	Date Request Submitted	How Request was Filed	Date, if any, of response	Response with in the timeframe mentioned in the law (Y/N)	Fee charged, if any (Yes/ N)	Data Provided Yes/No/Partially provided)	Legitimate (Information received) Partially legitimate(written refusal,transferred, referred,information not held)	Illegitimate (oral refusal, mute refusal, incomplete answer,unable to submit)	Comments
Chief Minister Secretariat	RTI 1	1. Under section 5(2) of KP RTI Act, each public body shall publish an annual report on what they have done to implement their obligations under KP RTI Act,2013 that shall include detailed information about the requests for information which they have received, and how they have processed these requests. 2. Please share a copy of RTI annual report of your department for last 2 years. (2018 and 2019).	7/23/2020	by Post	No response	8/11/2020	N	No	Legitimate/Referred		
	RTI 2	1. Please share certified information about the total amount of funds utilized on the advertisements of all types (public service message, awareness campaign, jobs, tenders etc.) in print and electronic media from May 2019 to May 2020.	7/22/2020	by Post	No response	N	N	No		Illegitimate (mute refusal)	
	RTI 3	1. Provide a list of vacant posts of sanctioned staff in your department and dates since when positions have been lying vacant in your department?	7/23/2020	by Post	No response	N	N	No		Illegitimate (mute refusal)	

Public Body		Question	Date Request Submitted	How Request was Filed	Date, if any, of response	Response with in the timeframe mentioned in the law (Y/N)	Fee charged, if any (Yes/ N)	Data Provided Yes/No/Partially provided)	Legitimate (Information received) Partially legitimate(written refusal,transferred, referred,information not held)	Illegitimate (oral refusal, mute refusal, incomplete answer,unable to submit)	Comments
Excise and Taxation Department KP	RTI 1	1. Under section 5(2) of KP RTI Act, each public body shall publish an annual report on what they have done to implement their obligations under KP RTI Act,2013 that shall include detailed information about the requests for information which they have received, and how they have processed these requests. 2. Please share a copy of RTI annual report of your department for last 2 years. (2018 and 2019).	7/23/2020	by Post	No response	8/11/2020	N	No	Legitimate/Referred		
	RTI 2	1. Please share certified information about the total amount of funds utilized on the advertisements of all types (public service message, awareness campaign, jobs, tenders etc.) in print and electronic media from May 2019 to May 2020.	7/22/2020	by Post	No response	N	N	No		illegitimate(mute refusal)	
	RTI 3	1. Provide a list of vacant posts of sanctioned staff in your department and dates since when positions have been lying vacant in your department?	7/23/2020	by Post	No response	N	N	No		illegitimate(mute refusal)	

Public Body		Question	Date Request Submitted	How Request was Filed	Date, if any, of response	Response with in the timeframe mentioned in the law (Y/N)	Fee charged, if any (Yes/ N)	Data Provided Yes/No/Partially provided)	Legitimate (Information received) Partially legitimate(written refusal,transferred, referred,information not held)	Illegitimate (oral refusal, mute refusal, incomplete answer,unable to submit)	Comments
Finance Department KP	RTI 1	1. Under section 5(2) of KP RTI Act, each public body shall publish an annual report on what they have done to implement their obligations under KP RTI Act,2013 that shall include detailed information about the requests for information which they have received, and how they have processed these requests. 2. Please share a copy of RTI annual report of your department for last 2 years. (2018 and 2019).	7/23/2020	by Post	No response	N	N	No	Legitimate/Department is working on Information request		
	RTI 2	1. Please share certified information about the total amount of funds utilized on the advertisements of all types (public service message, awareness campaign, jobs, tenders etc.) in print and electronic media from May 2019 to May 2020.	7/22/2020	by Post	No response	N	N	No		illegitimate(mute refusal)	
	RTI 3	1. Provide a list of vacant posts of sanctioned staff in your department and dates since when positions have been lying vacant in your department?	7/23/2020	by Post	No response	N	N	No		illegitimate(mute refusal)	

Public Body		Question	Date Request Submitted	How Request was Filed	Date, if any, of response	Response with in the timeframe mentioned in the law (Y/N)	Fee charged, if any (Yes/ N)	Data Provided Yes/No/Partially provided)	Legitimate (Information received) Partially legitimate(written refusal,transferred, referred,information not held)	Illegitimate (oral refusal, mute refusal, incomplete answer,unable to submit)	Comments
Higher Education Department KP	RTI 1	1. Under section 5(2) of KP RTI Act, each public body shall publish an annual report on what they have done to implement their obligations under KP RTI Act,2013 that shall include detailed information about the requests for information which they have received, and how they have processed these requests. 2. Please share a copy of RTI annual report of your department for last 2 years. (2018 and 2019).	7/23/2020	by Post	No response	N	N	No		illegitimate(mute refusal)	
	RTI 2	1. Please share certified information about the total amount of funds utilized on the advertisements of all types (public service message, awareness campaign, jobs, tenders etc.) in print and electronic media from May 2019 to May 2020.	7/22/2020	by Post	No response	N	N	No		illegitimate(mute refusal)	
	RTI 3	1. Provide a list of vacant posts of sanctioned staff in your department and dates since when positions have been lying vacant in your department?	7/23/2020	by Post	No response	N	N	No		illegitimate(mute refusal)	

Public Body		Question	Date Request Submitted	How Request was Filed	Date, if any, of response	Response with in the timeframe mentioned in the law (Y/N)	Fee charged, if any (Yes/ N)	Data Provided Yes/No/Partially provided)	Legitimate (Information received) Partially legitimate(written refusal,transferred, referred,information not held)	Illegitimate (oral refusal, mute refusal, incomplete answer,unable to submit)	Comments
Information and Public Relations Department	RTI 1	1. Under section 5(2) of KP RTI Act, each public body shall publish an annual report on what they have done to implement their obligations under KP RTI Act,2013 that shall include detailed information about the requests for information which they have received, and how they have processed these requests. 2. Please share a copy of RTI annual report of your department for last 2 years. (2018 and 2019).	7/23/2020	by Post	No response	N	N	No		illegitimate(mute refusal)	
	RTI 2	1. Please share certified information about the total amount of funds utilized on the advertisements of all types (public service message, awareness campaign, jobs, tenders etc.) in print and electronic media from May 2019 to May 2020.	7/22/2020	by Post	No response	N	N	No		illegitimate(mute refusal)	
	RTI 3	1. Provide a list of vacant posts of sanctioned staff in your department and dates since when positions have been lying vacant in your department?	7/23/2020	by Post	No response	N	N	No		illegitimate(mute refusal)	

Online Proactive Disclosure in Sindh																																																			
	Agriculture, Supply and Prices Department			Sindh Board of Revenue			Chief Minister Secretariat			Planning and Development			Zakat and Ushr Department			Culture, Tourism, Antiquities and Archives Department			Excise, Taxation and Narcotics Control Department			Transport and Mass Transit			Finance Department Sindh			Industries and Commerce			Sindh Home Department			Irrigation Department			Sindh Katchi Abadi Department			Minorities Affairs Department			Sindh Forest Department								
Section 6 of Sindh T& RTI Act 2016	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)	Published (Full/Full to Partial/Partial/Partial to None/None)	Score	Data Source (website or location of information)												
a) Particulars of its organization functions and duties;	None	0		Partial	50	http://www.srb.gos.pk/AboutUs/introductionSrb.jsp http://www.srb.gos.pk/AboutUs/vision-mission.jsp	Partial to none	25	https://cm.sindh.gov.pk/	Full	100	https://pnd.sindh.gov.pk/functions	Full	100	https://sindh.gov.pk/dpt/Zakar_Usher/index.htm https://sindh.gov.pk/dpt/Zakar_Usher/functions.htm	Full	100	https://sindhculture.gov.pk/about https://sindhculture.gov.pk/responsibilities	Full	100	https://excise.gos.pk/About-Us https://excise.gos.pk/Functions	Full to partial	75	https://sindh.gov.pk/dpt/Transport/index.html	Partial	50	https://fd.sindh.gov.pk/ https://fd.sindh.gov.pk/functions	Full	100	https://sindh.gov.pk/dpt/industriescommerce/index.htm https://sindh.gov.pk/dpt/industriescommerce/functions.htm	Partial	50	https://home.sindh.gov.pk/	Full	100	https://irrigation.sindh.gov.pk/functions-of-department https://irrigation.sindh.gov.pk/about-us	Full	100	https://s.kaa.sindh.gov.pk/ https://s.kaa.sindh.gov.pk/powers-functions-of-authority	Full	100	https://minorityaffairs.sindh.gov.pk/ https://minorityaffairs.sindh.gov.pk/goals-objective	Full	100	https://sindhforests.gov.pk/page-aboutus						
b) Powers and functions of its officers and employees;	Partial	50	http://sindhagri.gov.pk/CoreTeam.html http://sindhagri.gov.pk/Organogram.html	Full to Partial	80	http://www.srb.gos.pk/AboutUs/management.jsp	None	0		Full	100	https://pnd.sindh.gov.pk/team-members	Full to partial	75	https://sindh.gov.pk/dpt/Zakar_Usher/members.htm	None	0		None	0		None	0		Partial to none	15	https://fd.sindh.gov.pk/our-team	None	0		Partial to none	25	https://home.sindh.gov.pk/our-team	Full to partial	75	https://irrigation.sindh.gov.pk/about-us	Partial to none	10	https://s.kaa.sindh.gov.pk/our-team	Partial to none	25	https://minorityaffairs.sindh.gov.pk/our-team	None	0							
c) Norms and criteria set by it for the discharge of its daily functions;	None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		Full	100	https://s.kaa.sindh.gov.pk/rules-regulations	None	0		None	0										
d) Rules, regulations, notifications, circulars, instructions and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by it or being used by its employees in the discharge of its functions;	Partial	50	http://sindhagri.gov.pk/Transparency.html	Full	100	http://www.srb.gos.pk/downloads/download.jsp	None	0		None	0		None	0		Partial to none	25	https://sindhculture.gov.pk/acts-laws#laws	None	0		Full	100	https://fd.sindh.gov.pk/dpt/Transport/rule.html	Full	100	https://fd.sindh.gov.pk/financial-rules	None	0		None	0		Full to partial	75	https://irrigation.sindh.gov.pk/rules-and-regulations	Partial to none	25	https://s.kaa.sindh.gov.pk/rules-regulations	None	0		Full	100	https://sindhforests.gov.pk/page-rules-regulations						
e) Statement of categories of information that are under its control;	None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0							
f) Description of its decision making processes;	None	0		Full to Partial	75	http://www.srb.gos.pk/AboutUs/srb-organogram.jsp	None	0		Partial	50	https://pnd.sindh.gov.pk/organogram	Partial	50	https://sindh.gov.pk/dpt/Zakar_Usher/organogram.htm	Partial	50	https://sindhculture.gov.pk/organogram	Partial	50	https://excise.gos.pk/Organization	Partial	50	https://sindh.gov.pk/dpt/Transport/attachdept.jpg	Partial	50	https://fd.sindh.gov.pk/organogram	Partial to none	25	https://sindh.gov.pk/dpt/industriescommerce/organo.htm	None	0		Full	100	https://irrigation.sindh.gov.pk/organization-structure	None	0		None	0		Partial	50	https://sindhforests.gov.pk/page-organizational-structure						
g) Details of all its administrative and developmental decisions;	None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0							
h) Directory of its officers and employees with their qualifications and respective remuneration, perks and privileges	Partial to none	25		None	0		Partial to none	25	https://cm.sindh.gov.pk/contact-us	None	0		Partial to none	25	https://sindh.gov.pk/dpt/Zakar_Usher/contacts.htm	None	0		Partial	50	https://excise.gos.pk/Directory	None	0		None	0		Partial to none	25	https://sindh.gov.pk/dpt/industriescommerce/contacts.htm	None	0		None	0		None	0		Partial to none	15	https://minorityaffairs.sindh.gov.pk/contact-us	Full to partial	75	https://sindhforests.gov.pk/page-officers-directory						
i) Budget including details of all proposed and actual expenditures;	None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		Full	100	https://sindh.gov.pk/dpt/Zakar_Usher/budget.htm https://sindh.gov.pk/dpt/Zakar_Usher/alllocation.htm	None	0		None	0		None	0		Full	100	https://fd.sindh.gov.pk/budget-at-a-glance https://fd.sindh.gov.pk/provincial-receipts	None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0				
j) Manner of execution of subsidy programs;	None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		Full	100	https://sindh.gov.pk/dpt/Zakar_Usher/REVISED%20ZAKAT%20DISBURSEMENT%20PROCEDURE.pdf https://sindh.gov.pk/dpt/Zakar_Usher/f1ow%20o%20ak at.htm https://sindh.gov.pk/dpt/Zakar_Usher/criteria.pdf	None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0	
k) Full particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorization granted by it;	None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0							
l) Facilities available with the public for obtaining information held by it;	Partial to none	15	http://sindhagri.gov.pk/ContactUs.html	Full to Partial	80	http://www.srb.gos.pk/home/index.jsp#serv http://www.srb.gos.pk/SRBForms/forms.jsp	None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		Partial	50	https://sindhforests.gov.pk/page-contactus			
m) Complete particulars of its public information officer;	None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0							
n) Maintenance of record in respect of applications received and actions taken there to;	None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0		None	0							
Average Percentage		10			27.5			3.571428571			17.85714286			32.14285714			12.5			14.28571429				22.5			14.28571429			5.357142857				25			16.78571429			10			26.78571429								
Overall Status of Online Proactive Disclosure in Sindh	17%																																																		

Annexure D1: Reactive Disclosure – Sindh

Department name		Description of RTI	Date Request Submitted	How Request was Filed	Date, if any, of response	Response with in the timeframe mentioned in the law (Y/N)	Fee charged, if any (Yes/ N)	Data Provided Yes/No/Partially provided)	Legitimate (Information received) Partially legitimate(written refusal,transferred, referred,information not held)	Illegitimate (oral refusal, mute refusal, incomplete answer, unable to submit)	Comments
Finance Department	RTI 1	a) Provide a list of sanctioned staff in your department. (b) Please provide a list of vacant posts of sanctioned staff and dates since when positions have been lying vacant in your department ?	7/22/2020	by post	No response	N	N	No		Illegitimate (mute refusal)	
	RTI 2	Total amount of money paid for the utility bills (Electricity, water, Gas, Phone) from January 2020 to June 2020.	7/22/2020	by post	No response	N	N	No		Illegitimate (mute refusal)	
	RTI 3	Please share certified information about the total amount of funds utilized on the advertisements of all types (public service message, awareness campaign, jobs, tenders etc.) in print and electronic media from May 2019 to May 2020.	7/22/2020	by post	No response	N	N	No		Illegitimate (mute refusal)	
Information and Archives Department	RTI 1	a) Provide a list of sanctioned staff in your department. (b) Please provide a list of vacant posts of sanctioned staff and dates since when positions have been lying vacant in your department ?	7/22/2020	by post	No response	N	N	No		Illegitimate (mute refusal)	

Department name		Description of RTI	Date Request Submitted	How Request was Filed	Date, if any, of response	Response with in the timeframe mentioned in the law (Y/N)	Fee charged, if any (Yes/ N)	Data Provided Yes/No/Partially provided)	Legitimate (Information received) Partially legitimate(written refusal,transferred, referred,information not held)	Illegitimate (oral refusal, mute refusal, incomplete answer, unable to submit)	Comments
	RTI 2	Total amount of money paid for the utility bills (Electricity, water, Gas, Phone) from January 2020 to June 2020.	7/22/2020	by post	No response	N	N	No		Illegitimate (mute refusal)	
	RTI 3	Please share certified information about the total amount of funds utilized on the advertisements of all types (public service message, awareness campaign, jobs, tenders etc.) in print and electronic media from May 2019 to May 2020.	7/22/2020	by post	No response	N	N	No		Illegitimate (mute refusal)	
College Education Department											
	RTI 1	a) Provide a list of sanctioned staff in your department. (b) Please provide a list of vacant posts of sanctioned staff and dates since when positions have been lying vacant in your department ?	7/22/2020	by post	No response	N	N	No		Illegitimate (mute refusal)	
	RTI 2	Total amount of money paid for the utility bills (Electricity, water, Gas, Phone) from January 2020 to June 2020.	7/22/2020	by post	No response	N	N	No		Illegitimate (mute refusal)	

Department name		Description of RTI	Date Request Submitted	How Request was Filed	Date, if any, of response	Response with in the timeframe mentioned in the law (Y/N)	Fee charged, if any (Yes/ N)	Data Provided Yes/No/Partially provided)	Legitimate (Information received) Partially legitimate(written refusal,transferred, referred,information not held)	Illegitimate (oral refusal, mute refusal, incomplete answer, unable to submit)	Comments
	RTI 3	Please share certified information about the total amount of funds utilized on the advertisements of all types (public service message, awareness campaign, jobs, tenders etc.) in print and electronic media from May 2019 to May 2020.	7/22/2020	by post	No response	N	N	No		Illegitimate (mute refusal)	
Irrigation Department	RTI 1	a) Provide a list of sanctioned staff in your department. (b) Please provide a list of vacant posts of sanctioned staff and dates since when positions have been lying vacant in your department ?	7/22/2020	by post	No response	N	N	No		Illegitimate (mute refusal)	
	RTI 2	Total amount of money paid for the utility bills (Electricity, water, Gas, Phone) from January 2020 to June 2020.	7/22/2020	by post	No response	N	N	No		Illegitimate (mute refusal)	

Department name		Description of RTI	Date Request Submitted	How Request was Filed	Date, if any, of response	Response with in the timeframe mentioned in the law (Y/N)	Fee charged, if any (Yes/ N)	Data Provided Yes/No/Partially provided)	Legitimate (Information received) Partially legitimate(written refusal,transferred, referred,information not held)	Illegitimate (oral refusal, mute refusal, incomplete answer, unable to submit)	Comments
	RTI 3	Please share certified information about the total amount of funds utilized on the advertisements of all types (public service message, awareness campaign, jobs, tenders etc.) in print and electronic media from May 2019 to May 2020.	7/22/2020	by post	No response	N	N	No		Illegitimate (mute refusal)	
Chief Minister Secretariat	RTI 1	a) Provide a list of sanctioned staff in your department. (b) Please provide a list of vacant posts of sanctioned staff and dates since when positions have been lying vacant in your department ?	7/22/2020	by post	No response	N	N	No			
	RTI 2	Total amount of money paid for the utility bills (Electricity, water, Gas, Phone) from January 2020 to June 2020.	7/22/2020	by post	No response	N	N	No			

Department name		Description of RTI	Date Request Submitted	How Request was Filed	Date, if any, of response	Response with in the timeframe mentioned in the law (Y/N)	Fee charged, if any (Yes/ N)	Data Provided Yes/No/Partially provided)	Legitimate (Information received) Partially legitimate(written refusal,transferred, referred,information not held)	Illegitimate (oral refusal, mute refusal, incomplete answer, unable to submit)	Comments
	RTI 3	Please share certified information about the total amount of funds utilized on the advertisements of all types (public service message, awareness campaign, jobs, tenders etc.) in print and electronic media from May 2019 to May 2020.	7/22/2020	by post	No response	N	N	No			

Conclusion:

The report on the Status of RTI in Pakistan concludes with the moderate status of proactive disclosure and below average status of reactive disclosure in Pakistan. On the scale of proactive disclosure of information, Punjab government departments are at the top with 51% of online proactive disclosure of information, Federal government departments are at the 2nd place with 38%, and KP government is at the third place with 35% and only 17% of information is proactively disclosed by the government departments of Sindh as per the RTI law. Though these results are comparatively better than the previous year (2019) but the culture of responsiveness will take time in the public bodies.

During the year 2020, COVID-19 affected the whole world and its government functionaries. Similarly, right to information and other fundamental human rights got affected during the lockdown. As an adjustment to the ongoing pandemic, most of the Information Commissions around the world started the mechanism of online complaints and hearings, the same was done by the Information Commissions in Pakistan. In this time of crucial decision making at the level of government, availability and disclosure of information to the public becomes preeminent. The current times call for greater transparency and maximum proactive disclosure of information by government departments, especially through online means. Overall dynamics of freedom of expression in Pakistan have become apprehensive in year 2020 but the implementation of right to information laws is gaining strength at the federal and provincial level because the Information Commissions are carrying their mandate of ensuring implementation of RTI laws.

At CPDI, we believe that right to information regime is primarily based upon the proactive disclosure of information by government. As right to information culture slowly taking roots in Pakistan, one major observation comes from public officials is that information requests take too much of their time and they have little time left to focus on other business. The proactive disclosure is the answer to this objection. The more a department is proactive, the lesser information requests will it receive and subsequently has to spend lesser time respond to information requests. The federal and provincial governments of Pakistan shall take stringent efforts to ensure proactive disclosure of information, as it is pre-requisite of better, transparent, open and accountable government.

One cannot deny the significance of independent appellate forums/oversight bodies and its power to implement the RTI law, but the first and foremost responsibility of information disclosure is on the shoulders of government departments/officers who receive information requests from common citizens. So, there is a need to build capacity of government officers to bring RTI in the domain of standard operating procedure in the government departments. While processing 75 information requests for the purpose of compiling this report, CPDI team reached to a conclusion that there is a significant lack of culture of responsiveness in the provincial and government departments of Pakistan. Because out of 75 information requests filed by CPDI team, ratio of responses received was minimal i.e only 16 responses were received, out of which 5 information requests resulted in the disclosure of information. (As discussed in the above sections and attached

appendixes). With this ratio of responsiveness, information disclosure without the intervention of appellate forum becomes impossible.

Overall status of Right to Information in Pakistan is not satisfactory. Efforts are required from the demand and supply side both. The improvement can be brought by effective measures by the central government, provincial government and government departments. The objective of empowering people, containing corruption, and bringing transparency and accountability in the working of the Government can only be achieved by implementing right to information in its letter and spirit.

Centre for Peace and Development Initiatives (CPDI) is an independent, non-partisan and a not-for-profit civil society organization working on issues of peace and development in Pakistan. It is registered Under Section 42 of the Companies Ordinance, 1984 (XLVII of 1984). It was established in September 2003 by a group of concerned citizens who realized that there was a need to approach the issue of peace and development in an integrated manner. CPDI is a first initiative of its kind in Pakistan. It seeks to inform and influence public policies and civil society initiatives through research-based advocacy and capacity building in order to promote citizenship, build peace and achieve inclusive and sustainable development. Areas of special sectoral focus include promotion of peace and tolerance, rule of law, transparency and access to information, budget watch, media watch, election watch and legislative watch and development.



Centre for Peace and
Development Initiatives

☎ +92 51 831 27 94, 831 27 95

☎ +92 51 844 36 33

✉ info@cpdi-pakistan.org

f /cpdi.pakistan

📺 /cpdi_pakistan

📷 /cpdi_pak

A Company setup under Section 42 of the Companies Ordinance, 1984

www.cpdipakistan.org